

Screening for Appropriate Assessment of Ballyness Bay Aquaculture Licence Site T12/441A

ALAB Appeal Ref No. AP5/2025 (previously AP6/2020)

Appeal description:

Appeal against the decision of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine to grant an Aquaculture licence in November 2019, for the cultivation of clams & pacific oysters at Aquaculture Licence site T12/441A in Ballyness Bay, County Donegal.

Step 1 - Description of the project, purpose of this document and local site characteristics

Brief description of the project

Anthony McCafferty applied for an aquaculture licence for a 2-hectare site in Ballyness Bay for the cultivation of clams on wooden trays and pacific oysters using bags and trestles on the 10 August 2011.

After a reduction for environmental, navigation and visual reasons the minister decided to grant Anthony McCafferty a variation aquaculture licence for a 0.408-hectare site (T12/441A) for the cultivation of clams on wooden trays and pacific oysters using bags and trestles on 25 November 2019.

Clam seed (juvenile clams from approved hatcheries) will be sown into the intertidal mudflats & sandflats and covered with a mesh to protect the clams from predators. The edge of the mesh is buried in the substrate to a depth of approximately 10cm.

The clams remain buried and grow naturally in the sediment for around 3 years until they reach harvest size. The mesh is cleaned by a tractor drawn brush to suppress any growth of organic material on the mesh. Harvest will involve lifting the net and collecting market sized clams.

The proposed access to the site is from Magheraroarty Pier and Ballyness Pier, using tractors and trailers.

The current draft aquaculture licence for Site T12/441A prepared by the Minister in November 2019 contains a number of conditions related to the use of tractors (or other vehicles) accessing, leaving and operating on site. In particular, that all vehicles must adhere to the strictly approved access and egress routes and that the licensees shall organise operations in consultation with other licensed operators to ensure that the total number of vehicles and harvesting machines on the foreshore on any one day is kept to the minimum necessary.

Brief description of the site characteristics

The proposed project is located in Ballyness Bay, which is situated in north-west Donegal adjacent to the towns of Gortahork and Falcarragh.

Ballyness Bay is a large and very shallow estuarine complex, with extensive areas of sandflats which are exposed at low tide. The Dooey Peninsula stretches across the mouth of this well-sheltered bay, leaving only a narrow strait to the open sea.

Site T12/441A is located in the western side of Ballyness Bay; the site lies within 150m of the High-water mark.

There are currently no licenced aquaculture sites in Ballyness Bay. Two previous aquaculture licenced sites were in operation in the 1990's, both for the cultivation of Pacific oysters using the bags and trestles, however the last of these licences lapsed in 1999.

The Bay is currently not a Designated Shellfish Area nor a Classified Bivalve Mollusc Production Area.

The proposed aquaculture licence site T12/441A lies within the Ballyness Bay SAC and is 1.1 km from the Falcarragh to Meenlaragh SPA.

Purpose of this document

This report is the Screening for Appropriate Assessment for the proposed aquaculture licence site T12/441A and has been prepared in order to enable the Board to make a formal screening determination for the purposes of Regulation 42 of European Communities (Birds and Natural Habitats) Regulations 2011 as amended, and to confirm the European Sites which should be brought forward to a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment, prior to carrying out a public consultation under the 2011 Regulations.

Step 2 - Identification of relevant Natura 2000 sites using Source-Pathway-Receptor Model and compilation of information on qualifying interests and conservation objectives.

The Qualifying Interests (QI's) highlighted in **bold text** are deemed to have a source-pathway-receptor link and as such the relevant European sites have been screened in. Distances are measured as straight-line distances in open water, or along-shore coastal distances, depending on the site and QI's being considered and are measured from the closest point of the proposed licence boundary that is the subject of this appeal. SPA Qualifying Interests are assessed based on behavioural characteristics and foraging range.

Table 1: List of protected sites and their Qualifying Interests

European Site Code	Distance from the Proposed Project (km)	List of Qualifying Interests	Site Specific Conservation Objectives (Maintain/Restore favourable conservation condition)	Connections (Source- Pathway-Receptor link)	Qualifying Interests considered further in Screening Y/N	European Site Screening in for stage 2 Appropriate Assessment
		Estuaries [1130] Embryonic shifting dunes [2110]	Maintain Maintain	No	No	
		Shifting dunes along the shoreline with	Widirean	(no source-pathway-	(no source-	
		Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120]	Maintain	receptor link)	pathway-receptor	
		Humid dune slacks [2190]	Maintain		link)	
		Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013]	Maintain			
Ballyness Bay	0					
SAC (Site code 001090)	0			Yes – location of		Yes
001030)				project overlaps with	Yes – possible	163
		Mudflats and sandflats not covered by	Maintain	1140 Mudflats and	physical	
		seawater at low tide [1140]		sandflats not covered	disturbance and	
				by seawater at low	habitat loss	
				tide		

		Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]	Restore	Yes – project located 188m from 2130 Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes)	Yes – possible physical disturbance and habitat loss	
		Coastal lagoons [1150]	Restore			
		Reefs [1170]	Maintain			
		Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220] Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230] ¹ Atlantic salt meadows (Glauco- Puccinellietalia maritimae) [1330] ² Mediterranean salt meadows (Juncetalia	Maintain			
		maritimi) [1410]	Maintain			
Gweedore Bay		Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] Shifting dunes along the shoreline with	Maintain			
and Islands SAC (Site code	3.6	Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120] Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous	Maintain			
001141)		vegetation (grey dunes) [2130] Decalcified fixed dunes with Empetrum	Restore			
		nigrum [2140]	Maintain	No	No	
		Atlantic decalcified fixed dunes (Calluno-		(no source-pathway-		
		Ulicetea) [2150] Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea	Maintain	receptor link)		
		(Salicion arenariae) [2170]	Maintain			Yes
		Humid dune slacks [2190]	Maintain			1.03
		Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]	Restore			
		Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing				
		waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea				

¹ No Site-Specific Conservation Objectives at time of writing and as such the habitat/species conservation objectives from the nearest applicable site has been used.

		uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanojuncetea				ļ
		[3130] ²				
		European dry heaths [4030]	Maintain			
		Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060]	Maintain			
		Juniperus communis formations on heaths				
		or calcareous grasslands [5130]	Restore			
		Euphydryas aurinia (Marsh Fritillary)				
		[1065] ²				
		Phocoena phocoena (Harbour Porpoise)				
		[1351] ²				
		Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395]	Maintain			
		Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Maintain			
		Najas fiexilis (Sieridei Naiau) [1835]	iviaiiitaiii			
					Yes – possible	
				Yes – project within	visual disturbance	
		Lutra lutra (Otter) [1355]	Maintain	1355 Otter foraging	& above water	
				range	noise disturbance	
		Embryonic shifting dunes [2110]	Maintain			
		Shifting dunes along the shoreline with				
		Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120]	Maintain			
		Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous				
Hama Haad		vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]	Maintain			
Horn Head		Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea				
and Rinclevan	6.9	(Salicion arenariae) [2170]	Restore	No	No	
SAC (Site code		Humid dune slacks [2190]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-		
000147)		Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]	Restore	receptor link)		
		Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing				
		waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea				
		uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanojuncetea				
		[3130]	Maintain			Yes

		Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013] Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Maintain Maintain Maintain			
		Halichoerus grypus (Grey Seal) [1364]	Maintain	yes (Project located 810m from MI identified seal haul out site.²)	Yes – possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	
		Oligotrophic waters containing very few minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia uniflorae) [3110]	Maintain			
Cloghernagore		Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260]	Maintain			
Bog and		Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica				
Glenveagh	7.4	tetralix [4010]	Restore			
National Park		European dry heaths [4030]	Maintain	No (No service methods)	NI-	
SAC (site code 02047)		Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or	Restore	(No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
02047)		clayey-silt-laden soils (Molinion caeruleae)		receptor link)		
		[6410]	Maintain			
		Blanket bogs (if active bog) [7130]	Restore			
		Depressions on peat substrates of the				
		Rhynchosporion [7150]	Restore			

² The Marine Institute's February 2019 report supporting Appropriate Assessment of Aquaculture in Ballyness Bay SAC concluded that in relation to interactions between aquaculture operations and seal use of the site [Ballyness Bay SAC], the risk of disturbance cannot be discounted and that based upon local observations it appears that seals are faithful to this one identified haul out location [identified sand bank in northwest of Bay]. The report further concluded that careful consideration should be given to licencing the site which shares the sandbank with the observed seal haul out. The DAFM Mitigation Summary subsequently states that "Proposed sites where there is proximity to seal sites will be reduced where possible or not licensed to maintain a buffer between the aquaculture sites and the seal areas." Licence decisions for affected sites were refused/granted with variations based on a 200m buffer zone around the identified seal haul out location.

(site code 000140)		Rhynchosporion [7150] Margaritifera margaritifera (Freshwater Pearl Mussel) [1029]	Restore Restore	receptor link)		
Fawnboy Bog/Lough Nacung SAC	8.8	Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010] Blanket bogs (if active bog) [7130] Depressions on peat substrates of the	Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway-	No	No
Muckish Mountain SAC (site code 001179)	8.1	Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Siliceous rocky slopes with chasmophytic vegetation [8220]	Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
		Lutra lutra (Otter) [1355] Salmo salar (Salmon) [1106]	Maintain Maintain	Yes – project within 1355 Otter foraging range Yes – project within 1106 Atlantic Salmon migratory route	Yes – possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance Yes – possible physical disturbance due to increased macroalgal levels along 1106 Atlantic Salmon migratory route	
		Old sessile oak woods with Ilex and Blechnum in the British Isles [91A0] Margaritifera margaritifera (Freshwater Pearl Mussel) [1029] Vandenboschia speciosa (Killarney Fern) [6985]	Maintain Restore Maintain			Yes

		Coastal lagoons [1150]	Restore			
		Reefs [1170]	Maintain			
Tory Island		Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220]	Maintain	No		
SAC (site code:	10.8	Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and		(No source-pathway-	No	No
002259)		Baltic coasts [1230]	Maintain	receptor link)		
•		Submerged or partially submerged sea		, ,		
		caves [8330] ²				
Cassianla		Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing				
Sessiagh		waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea		No		
Lough SAC	13	uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanojuncetea		(No source-pathway-	No	No
(site code		[3130]	Restore	receptor link)		
000185)		Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Restore			
		Mudflats and sandflats not covered by				
		seawater at low tide [1140]	Maintain			
		Annual vegetation of drift lines [1210] ²				
		Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and				
		Baltic coasts [1230] ²				
		Salicornia and other annuals colonising				
		mud and sand [1310] ²				
		Atlantic salt meadows (Glauco-				
Sheephaven		Puccinellietalia maritimae) [1330]		No		
SAC	14.3	Mediterranean salt meadows (Juncetalia	Restore	(No source-pathway-	No	No
(site code	10	maritimi) [1410]		receptor link)	110	
001190)		Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] ²	Maintain			
		Shifting dunes along the shoreline with				
		Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120]				
		Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous	Restore			
		vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]				
		Humid dune slacks [2190] ²	Restore			
		Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]				
		Old sessile oak woods with Ilex and	Maintain			
		Blechnum in the British Isles [91A0]				

		Euphydryas aurinia (Marsh Fritillary) [1065] ² Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395]	Maintain			
			Maintain			
Tranarossan and Melmore Lough SAC (site code 000194)	18.8	Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide [1140] Annual vegetation of drift lines [1210] Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220] Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230] Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] Shifting dunes along the shoreline with Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120] Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes) [2130] Decalcified fixed dunes with Empetrum nigrum [2140] Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea (Salicion arenariae) [2170] Humid dune slacks [2190] Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0] Hard oligo-mesotrophic waters with benthic vegetation of Chara spp. [3140] European dry heaths [4030] Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395]	Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Falcarragh to Meenlaragh SPA (site code 004149)	1.1	Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link. Purely terrestrial species)	No	No

Inishbofin, Inishdooey		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
and Inishbeg SPA (site code 004083)	2.4	Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Lesser Black-backed Gull (Larus fuscus) [A183] Arctic Tern (Sterna paradisaea) [A194]	Restore Restore Restore	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Derryveagh and Glendowan		Merlin (Falco columbarius) [A098] Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103]	Maintain Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
Mountains SPA (site code 4039)	7.5	Red-throated Diver (Gavia stellata) [A001] Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140] Dunlin (Calidris alpina schinzii) [A466]	Maintain Maintain Maintain	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Horn Head to Fanad Head		Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Kittiwake (Rissa tridactyla) [A188] Guillemot (Uria aalge) [A199] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200] Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser	Restore Maintain Restore Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
SPA (site code 09194)	7.3	albifrons flavirostris) [A395] Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103] Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346] Cormorant (Phalacrocorax carbo) [A017]	Restore Maintain Restore Restore	Yes – Project within these coastal species	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water	Yes
		Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018]	Restore	foraging ranges	noise disturbance	
West Donegal SPA (site code 04150)	10.1	Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Kittiwake (Rissa tridactyla) [A188] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200] Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103]	Restore Restore Restore Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	

		Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346] Cormorant (Phalacrocorax carbo) [A017] Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018] Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Restore Restore Maintain Restore	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
West Donegal Islands SPA (site code 04230)	11	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	Yes
	11	Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018] Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Maintain Restore Maintain	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	res
Tory island SPA (site code 004073)	12.2	Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200] Puffin (Fratercula arctica) [A204]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Lough Fern SPA (site code 004060)	28.5	Pochard (Aythya ferina) [A059] Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Restore Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Greers Isle SPA (site code 004082)	29	Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus ridibundus) [A179] Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Sandwich Tern (Thalasseus sandvicensis) [A863]	Restore Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Illancrone and Inishkeeragh	29.8	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Common Tern (Sterna hirundo) [A193] ³	Restore Restore	No		No

³ The 22 March 2024 ALAB TA AA Supplementary Report (available on the ALAB website at <u>2024 03 22 ALAB AA report final.pdf</u>) included four additional sites Illancrone & Inishkeeragh SPA, Roaninish SPA, Lough Swilly SPA and Lough Foyle SPA in an extended stage 1 screening for AA exercise. The four sites are included in

SPA (site code		Arctic Tern (Sterna paradisaea) [A194] ⁴	Restore	(No source-pathway-	No	
004132)		Little Tern (Sterna albifrons) [A195] ⁴	Maintain	receptor link)		
		Great Crested Grebe (Podiceps cristatus) [A005] Grey Heron (Ardea cinerea) [A028] Whooper Swan (Cygnus cygnus) [A038] Greylag Goose (Anser anser) [A043] Shelduck (Tadorna tadorna) [A048] Teal (Anas crecca) [A052] Mallard (Anas platyrhynchos) [A053]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain			
		Scaup (Aythya marila) [A062] Goldeneye (Bucephala clangula) [A067] Red-breasted Merganser (Mergus serrator)	Maintain Maintain	No		
		[A069]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-	No	
Lough Swilly	2.4	Coot (Fulica atra) [A125]	Maintain	receptor link)		
SPA (site code 004075)	34	Oystercatcher (Haematopus ostralegus) [A130]	Maintain			
004073)		Knot (Calidris canutus) [A143]	Maintain			
		Dunlin (Calidris alpina) [A149]	Maintain			
		Curlew (Numenius arguata) [A160]	Maintain			
		Redshank (Tringa totanus) [A162]	Maintain			
		Greenshank (Tringa nebularia) [A164]	Maintain			
		Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus				
		ridibundus) [A179] ⁴	Maintain			
		Common Tern (Sterna hirundo) [A193] ⁴	Maintain			
		Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser	Maintain			
		albifrons flavirostris) [A395]				
		Wigeon (Mareca penelope) [A855]	Maintain			Yes
		Shoveler (Spatula clypeata) [A857]	Maintain			1.03

the above screening table, and I concluded that three of the four sites are to be carried forward for stage 2 AA based on species behavioural characteristics and foraging range i.e. there is no S-P-R link for a number of the species due to their behavioural characteristics/foraging ranges.

		Sandwich Tern (Thalasseus sandvicensis)	Maintain			
		[A863] ⁴ Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain		Yes - possible	
		Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182]	Maintain	Yes – Project within this coastal species foraging ranges	visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	
Inishkeel SPA (site code 004116)	36	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Roaninish SPA		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
(site code 004121)	36.5	Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Restore	Yes – Project within this coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Lough Nillan Bog SPA (site code 004110)	49	Merlin (Falco columbarius) [A098] Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140] Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser albifrons flavirostris) [A395] Dunlin (Calidris alpina schinzii) [A466]	Maintain Restore Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Sheskinmore Lough SPA (site code 004090)	41	Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser albifrons flavirostris) [A395]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No

		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045]	Maintain			
Trawbreaga		Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla		No		
Bay SPA (site	51.5	hrota) [A046]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-	No	No
code 004034)		Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346]	Maintain	receptor link)		
		Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain			
		Great Northern Diver (Gavia immer) [A003]	Maintain			
Donegal Bay		Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla		No		
SPA (site code	PA (site code 53	hrota) [A046]	Maintain	No (No course pathway)		Na
004151)	Common Scoter (Melanitta nigra) [A065]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-	No	No	
		Sanderling (Calidris alba) [A144]	Maintain	receptor link)		
		Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain			
		Red-throated Diver (Gavia stellata) [A001]	Maintain			
		Great Crested Grebe (Podiceps cristatus)				
		[A005]	Maintain			
		Bewick's Swan (Cygnus columbianus				
		bewickii) [A037]	Maintain			
		Whooper Swan (Cygnus cygnus) [A038]	Maintain			
		Greylag Goose (Anser anser) [A043]	Maintain			
		Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla				
Lough Foulo		hrota) [A046]	Maintain	No	No	
Lough Foyle	56	Shelduck (Tadorna tadorna) [A048]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-		
SPA (site code 004087)	50	Teal (Anas crecca) [A052]	Maintain	receptor link)		
004087)		Mallard (Anas platyrhynchos) [A053]	Maintain			
		Eider (Somateria mollissima) [A063]	Maintain			
		Red-breasted Merganser (Mergus serrator)				
		[A069]	Maintain			
		Oystercatcher (Haematopus ostralegus)				
		[A130]	Maintain			
		Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140]	Maintain			
		Lapwing (Vanellus vanellus) [A142]	Maintain			
		Knot (Calidris canutus) [A143]	Maintain			Yes

Dunlin (Calidris alpina) [A149] Bar-tailed Godwit (Limosa lapponica)	Maintain			
[A157]	Maintain			
Curlew (Numenius arquata) [A160]	Maintain			
Redshank (Tringa totanus) [A162]	Maintain			
Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus				
ridibundus) [A179]				
Wigeon (Mareca penelope) [A855]	Maintain			
Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain			
			Yes - possible	
Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182]	Maintain	Yes – Project within	visual disturbance	
Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Maintain	these coastal species	& above water	
		foraging ranges	noise disturbance	

Step 3 Assessment of likely significant effects

Table 2: List of all potential direct and indirect impacts that may have an effect on the conservation objectives of a European site, taking into account the size and scale of the project.

Impacts	Possible Significance of Impacts (duration, magnitude etc.)
Physical disturbance and habitat loss	Possible direct impacts on 1140 Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide & 2130 Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes)
Visual disturbance and above water noise disturbance	Possible indirect impacts on bird species identified in table 1
	Possible temporal indirect impacts on 1355 Otter
	Possible indirect impacts on 1364 Grey Seal
Physical disturbance	Possible indirect impacts on 1106 Atlantic Salmon

In-Combination Effects

Following a search of relevant databases undertaken on the 17 October 2025 and having regard to the European Commission's *Assessment of plans and projects in relation to Natura 2000 sites*⁴ Guidance document, the below project(s) have been identified as potential in-combination projects.

Table 3: List of potential in-combination projects

Application reference(s)	Project description	Distance to aquaculture licence site T12/441A (km)	Project status
Т12/407В	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/407B in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.025	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/409B1 and T12/409B2	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles and cultivation of clams (Ruditapes philippinarum) on wooden trays under mesh on the intertidal/sub-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/409B in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.17 (to 409B1) and 0.37 (to 409B2)	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister

_

⁴ Assessment of plans and projects in relation to Natura 2000 sites – Methodological guidance on the provisions of Article 6(3) and (4) of the Habitats Directive 92/43/EEC 2021/C 437/01(Commission notice C/2021/6913. Dated 28.10.2021).

T12/502A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the foreshore on site ref T12/502A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.02	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister
T12/441B	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the foreshore on site ref T12/441B in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.87	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/441C	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the foreshore on site ref T12/441C in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.83	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/500A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/500A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.15	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/409A	Cultivation of clams on wooden trays under mesh on the inter-tidal/sub- tidal foreshore on site ref T12/409A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal	0.31	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/514A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/514A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.94	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/515A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/515A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.12	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/516A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/516A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	1.41	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/455A	cultivate Pacific Oysters using bags and trestles on the foreshore on site ref T12/455A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal	1.31	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister
T12/455B	cultivate Pacific Oysters using bags and trestles on the foreshore on site ref T12/455B in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal	0.95	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister
T12/510A	cultivate Pacific Oysters using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/510A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal	1.85	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister

The following plans, related to the development of the maritime environment were also identified:

- The Climate Action Plan 2025
- River Basin Management Plans 2022-2027 (RBMP)
- Donegal County Development Plan 2024 2030
- National Biodiversity Action Plan 2023 2030

It cannot be excluded on the basis of objective scientific information that the proposed aquaculture project in combination with the above listed projects and plans, will have a significant effect on Ballyness Bay SAC, Gweedore Bay and Islands SAC, Horn Head and Rinclevan SAC, Cloghernagore Bog and Glenveagh National Park SAC, Inishbofin, Inishdooey and Inishbeg SPA, Derryveagh and Glendowan Mountains SPA, Horn Head to Fanad Head SPA, West Donegal SPA, West Donegal Islands SPA, Lough Swilly SPA, Roaninish SPA and Lough Foyle SPA particularly in relation to those projects which could potentially cause increased physical disturbance or habitat loss (such as other aquaculture licensed activities increasing the potential for habitat loss or increased organic material) and increased visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance.

Were mitigation measures considered during the screening process? No

Step 4 Screening Determination Statement

The assessment of significant effects:

On the basis of the information on file, and having regard to:

- The nature and scale of the proposed development
- The distance to the nearest European sites
- The potential for in-combination effects with other plans and projects
- Physical disturbance
- Physical disturbance and habitat loss
- Visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance

Having considered the legal framework applicable to Appropriate Assessment, it was concluded that the project the subject of the proposed Aquaculture Licence for the cultivation of clams & pacific oysters on site T12/441A in Ballyness Bay, County Donegal will require Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment as it cannot be excluded on the basis of objective scientific information following screening that the proposed project, individually or in combination with other plans or projects, will have a significant effect on a European Site.

Conclusion			
	Tick as appropriate	Recommendation	
(i) The possibility of significant effects on a European site can be excluded			
(ii) The possibility of significant effects on a European site cannot be excluded	✓	Proceed to Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment	
Senior Technical Advisor Signature and Date			

Appendix 1:
T12/441A Aquaculture Licence Map

